DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 125 961 SO 009 249

AUTHOR Kurfman, Dana; And Others
TITLE Cultural Geography Evaluation Report.
PUB DATE 24 Mar 69
NOTE 19p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 HC-$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Course Evaluation; *Curriculum Development; *Curriculum Evaluation; Formative Evaluation; *Geography; *Geography Instruction; Human Geography; Secondary Education; *Teacher Attitudes
IDENTIFIERS *High School Geography Project; HSGP

ABSTRACT

The teacher field-test evaluation results from the Cultural Geography Unit of the High School Geography Project are presented in the report. During 1968-69, 29 teachers from 22 states used the materials with over 950 students. Five unit activities received good to excellent overall ratings, while two activities received good overall ratings. The overall rating included categories of teacher enjoyment, teacher estimated effectiveness, student interest, and student estimate of worth. Teacher recommendations for revisions on each of the individual activities are included. The teacher ratings of the complete unit compared with other units in the project materials indicated that Cultural Geography ranks in the middle as far as teacher enjoyment and effectiveness. The appendices include the complete survey results and a comparison of the 1968 evaluation results to the 1967 evaluation results. (Author/DE)

****
* Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished *
* materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort *
* to obtain the best copy available. Nevertheless, items of marginal *
* reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality *
* of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available *
* via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not *
* responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions *
* supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original. *
****

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

RECEIVED
SOCIAL SCIENCE EDUCATION CONSORTIUM
NOT TO BE REMOVED FROM LIBRARY

ED125961

CULTURAL GEOGRAPHY
EVALUATION REPORT

Prepared by

Dana Kurfman
Robert Richburg
and
Ina Phillips

SO 009 249

2

March 24, 1969

DESCRIPTION OF THE LIMITED SCHOOL TRIALS

The 1968-69 limited school trials have as their purpose the feedback of information useful in modifying the units being tried out. There have been HSGP limited school trials during the past three school years. Although the Culture unit was not involved in the 1966-67 school trials, it was included in last year's trials.

The Unit Materials

The unit materials consist of a Teacher's Guide, Student Resources and a Student Manual. Also included are transparencies, maps and two sets of slides.

All six activities in the Culture unit are considered to be integral. They are: "Different Ideas About Circle," "Games Illustrating the Spread of Ideas," "A Lesson from Sports," "Expansion of Islam," "Canada: A Regional Question," and "Culture Change: A Trend Toward Uniformity."

The Teachers

Twenty-nine teachers were selected for the 1968-69 trials. They are located in 22 different states throughout the country, 26 of them in public schools and three in parochial schools. There is reason to believe that they are considerably above average in teaching experience and in their understanding of geography. The average teaching experience of the group is about nine years, which compares to eight for the 1967-68 trials. They have had, on an average, 34 hours of geography in their college background. This is an average of 7 more hours than last year and twice that of two years ago. Their average teaching experience in the field of geography is about 4 and one-half years. Eighteen of them spend more than 50 per cent of their time teaching geography. Twenty of them have participated in NDEA or NSF institutes. Ten are teachers in city schools, 15 teach in suburban schools and 4 teach in rural schools. Also, 13 of the 27 teachers taught HSGP materials in earlier trials.

The Students

Each of these teachers had one or two classes of students. Approximately 950 students participated in all. Thirty eight per cent are in ninth grade, 26 per cent are in tenth grade, 10 per cent are in eleventh grade and 26 per cent are in twelfth grade. The proportion of tenth graders is somewhat higher than in previous years. The eleventh and twelfth graders comprise about one-third of the students as they did last year. Thus, as for last year's trials, this is probably

a more mature group of students than those taking geography in American high schools.

In addition they have a higher verbal aptitude than expected for the ultimate users of the material. The mean for the whole group is the 64th percentile. This is just one percentile lower than last year. The ninth graders rank at the 75th percentile, the tenth graders at the 56th percentile, the eleventh graders at the 53rd percentile and the twelfth graders at the 60th percentile.

Also it may be of interest to note that four teachers estimate that their students are from low income families, fifteen that their students are from median income families and ten teachers that their students are from high income families.

The Evaluation Instruments

Estimates of verbal aptitude were obtained by administering the verbal section of the Cooperative School and College Ability Test (SCAT) Form 3B. Information about the teachers was obtained by a background information questionnaire.

Teachers and students filled out evaluation forms at the conclusion of each activity. In addition, teachers filled out an evaluation of the unit as a whole. Results from these questionnaires may be found in appendices A and B of this report.

During the 1968-69 school trials test results for students are derived from a pool of 200 test items. These 200 items were divided into four test forms. Through a rotation system all students take all the test items. However, none of the items pertain directly to the Culture unit. The results of the four test administrations will be summarized in a later report.

THE UNIT AS A WHOLE

Teachers rate the Cultural Geography Unit above the Geography of Cities Unit and below the Manufacturing and Agriculture Unit tried out this year. This conclusion holds for all three major indices.

	Culture	M&A	Cities
Teacher enjoyment	3.36*	3.78*	3.42*
Effectiveness compared to non HSGP units	3.38*	3.56*	3.12*
Worth compared to other geographic learnings	3.54*	3.81*	3.42*

Expressions of student interest are not available for the unit as a whole.

For most of the activities teacher enjoyment is at the same level as it was in the former version of the activity. However, the "Games" and the "Islam" activities received significantly higher ratings than their predecessors. Every activity in the unit received a significantly higher student interest rating this year than it did last year.

In the table that follows, each of the activities in the unit is given a rating from "fair" to "excellent" on each of four criteria. These ratings are summarized in the form of the overall rating. Ratings are determined in reference to activities tried out in 1967-68. "Excellent" activities would have been in the top quartile that year; "good" in the second quartile; "fair" in the third quartile and "poor" in the fourth quartile. The overall strength of the unit is indicated by the lack of "poor" ratings and the presence of only three "fair" ratings.

* In order to summarize questionnaire data each teacher's and student's response is given a numerical score: very negative = 1; somewhat negative = 2; somewhat positive = 3; very positive = 4. When the mean rating of all teachers or students on a given question is obtained for a unit or activity, it can be placed on a scale ranging from 1 to 4.

VALUE RATINGS OF CULTURAL GEOGRAPHY UNIT ACTIVITIES

	Teacher Enjoyment	Teacher Est. of Effectiveness	Student Interest	Student Est. of Worth	Overall Rating
Act. 1 Cattle	3.66 Good(+)	3.21 Good	2.97 Excellent	2.99 Excellent	Good to Excellent
Act. 2 Games	3.51 Fair(+)	3.19 Good	3.00 Excellent	2.89 Excellent(-)	Good to Excellent
Act. 3 Sports	3.54 Good(-)	3.36 Good	3.16 Excellent	3.07 Excellent	Good to Excellent
Act. 4 Islam	3.46 Fair	3.18 Good	2.69 Good(-)	2.82 Good	Good
Act. 5 Canada	3.26 Fair	3.07 Good	2.85 Excellent	2.85 Good(+)	Good
Act. 6 Culture Change	3.71 Excellent(-)	3.61 Excellent	3.02 Excellent	2.99 Excellent	Excellent

The directions of revision efforts are indicated in Appendix A, Final Teacher Questionnaire Summary. An unusually high percentage of teachers consider the subject matter of the unit too elementary. This may well be a reflection of opinion from teachers of juniors and seniors. Teachers also suggest that the activities needing most revision attention are "Games", "Islam," and "Canada."

RECOMMENDATIONS ON INDIVIDUAL ACTIVITIES

Activity One - Different Ideas about Cattle

Teachers rated the activity good and students excellent. The final questionnaire showed teachers rating it right at the top of the unit with the Culture Change activity, in terms of importance and the need for little revision. On all indices it is about average for the 23 integral activities tried out this year. Its teacher rating was the same as

that given to the former version of the activity, but student interest is somewhat higher for this version.

1. Indicate that three rather than two days are needed.

2. Indicate that some aspects of the activity may seem unsophisticated to high school seniors. Possibly some parts of the activity can be noted as less appropriate for students with a good sense of culture relativity.

3. If possible, provide more background for teachers. References might help.

Activity Two - Games Illustrating the Spread of Ideas

While receiving an overall good rating, Games Illustrating the Spread of Ideas was better received by students than by teachers. Whereas students rated this activity excellent on both indices, teachers rated it fair in terms of their enjoyment in teaching it and good in their estimate of its effectiveness. Games did receive better ratings on the indices of student interest and teacher enjoyment in this tryout than in the 1967-68 school trials. However, in relation to other activities in the unit and in relation to other activities in this year's trials this activity is considered to be only an average activity.

1. Allow three days teaching time rather than the present two and one-half to three days.

2. Consider revising the discussion questions on pp. 19-21 in the Teacher's Guide. Several teachers felt these questions labored the point. One felt the second question on page 21 particularly insulted the intelligence of his students. Another suggested the questions be related to examples with which students are more familiar.

3. Consider suggesting some modifications for the teacher with a bright class. On their final evaluation of the unit six teachers cited this activity as being too elementary. Additional teachers brought out this point in their evaluation of the activity. One teacher suggested combining the access and modification games, another felt that the barriers game offered no challenge.

4. Consider giving additional stress to the point that teachers need to be prepared in advance for this activity to work smoothly. One teacher said the sentence on the bottom of p.11 in the Teacher's Guide was a definite

understatement. Four other teachers said the games were very difficult to manage.

5. Reexamine the questions related to the optional readings. One teacher said the questions related to the Peace Corps readings were inadequate. Also, there is no question at the conclusion of the reading on corn.

6. Clarify the directions in the last paragraph on p.22 of the Teacher's Guide. One teacher suggested changing "same" to "original". Another suggested repeating the phrase only once if the answers are correct. His students were whispering "same as before" and changing words on purpose.

7. Check directions in first paragraph on p.16 of the Teacher's Guide. Apparently A-3 is already shaded on the transparency.

8. Consider either omitting or expanding the directions in the Student Resources related to the games. One teacher said students were confused as to why only one game was mentioned. Other students wanted to know how the one game related to the readings.

Activity Three - A Lesson from Sports

Students have great interest in the topic of this activity and rated it excellent on both indices. In fact, it was their favorite activity in the Culture unit. On the other hand, teachers rated it good on both indices and felt that in relation to other activities in the unit it was average. This difference in reception is also quite pronounced when A Lesson from Sports is related to all the other activities in this year's trials. Students rated it enough higher this year than last year, that it now ranks on both indices as one of their five favorite HSGP activities. However, teachers did not rate it any higher this year than last. In relation to the 23 integral activities involved this year, they consider it an average activity. In fact, three teachers felt it should be made optional and four others felt it was too elementary for their students.

1. If the activity is left in its present form, allow two and one-half to three days, rather than three days teaching time.

2. Consider suggesting other topics, in addition to sports, for the discussion of diffusion. Two teachers suggested such topics as music, architecture, food, dress, etc. Several other teachers felt the activity needed more depth.

3. Consider including a larger map for students to mark the sports on. Several teachers said their students found the map inadequate and were confused by it.

4. Consider including an answer to the italicized question on page 16 of the Teacher's Guide.

Activity Four - Expansion of Islam

The "good" rating this activity received was the lowest overall rating of all activities in the unit. It was rated next to last by teachers and last by students. More teachers were either extremely positive or extremely negative than usually is the case. Teachers indicated that it is one of three activities needing the most revision. In terms of all 23 activities tried out this year it is rated slightly below average by teachers and near the bottom by students. Nevertheless it's rating by both teachers and students is considerably higher than that received by the activity it replaced.

1. Indicate that five rather than three to four days are needed.

2. Reconsider the procedures suggested for organizing the student reading and reporting. Six teachers felt the suggested procedures did not work well. Also, instructions for how much each group is to read for each time period are confusing to some. One reporting time rather than three may be advisable. Sister Helen's suggestions may warrant consideration.

3. Recommend use of the Life filmstrips on Islam. Several teachers used it to present the "idea" of Islam.

4. Consider the use of slides.

5. Check Makran (p.29 S.R.) spelling with Mahren (p.11 S.M.).

6. Reexamine the reading to make it more suitable for slow readers.

Activity Five - Canada: A Regional Question

Activity Five received an overall rating of good. Teachers rated it fair in their enjoyment of it and good in their estimate of its effectiveness. Students rated it excellent

in terms of their interest and good in their estimate of its worth. However, of all the activities in the Culture unit this activity was the most poorly received by teachers. Students rated it second to the last. Although this activity was better received this year than the year before, it is considered by both students and teachers to be below average compared to the other activities of this year's trials.

1. Consider including more background material in the Teacher's Guide. Thirty per cent of the teachers felt the need for more background and resource materials.

2. Review the Teacher's Guide as to clarity of direction. Four teachers felt the Guidelines were inadequate in this respect. One teacher mentioned pages 49-50 in particular.

3. Consider ways to increase student interest in this activity. Five teachers felt students were not motivated by this activity. Four others felt this material was too elementary. Six teachers felt the fault was in the discussion questions. Suggestions included improving the questions that are there, adding questions related to minority groups in the United States and adding questions to develop the concept of a region.

4. Consider including larger maps for students to work on. Several teachers felt they were too small for group work.

Activity Six - Culture Change: A Trend to Uniformity

This activity received uniformly excellent ratings. Both students and teachers rated it high in relation to other activities in the unit. Students rated it near the top and teachers considered it to be the best activity in the unit. In terms of all twenty-three activities receiving tryout this year it is in the top fourth on teacher ratings and the top third on student ratings. Students rated the activity significantly higher this year than they did last year. Seldom have we had an activity about which so many teachers said, "Fine. It is ready to go as is."

1. Indicate that two to three, rather than two days are needed for the activity.

2. Attempt to make the optional readings more simple and interesting.

APPENDIX A
Final Teacher Questionnaire Summary

Use two letters (A-D and X,Y, or Z) to indicate your view of each activity in its present form.

A. Essential to the unit
B. Important to the unit
C. Could be optional
D. Could be dropped

X. Hardly any revision is needed
Y. Some revision is needed
Z. Considerable revision is needed

23A,4B,1C	Activity 1: Different Ideas about Cattle	25X,2Y
17A,8B,3C	Activity 2: Games Illustrating the Spread of Ideas	14X,11Y,2Z
11A,13B,3C	Activity 3: A Lesson from Sports	23X,2Y,1Z
23A,3B,1C,1D	Activity 4: Expansion of Islam	14X,10Y,3Z
16A,5B,5C,2D	Activity 5: Canada: A Regional Problem	11X,13Y,3Z
23A,4B	Activity 6: Culture Change: A Trend Toward Uniformity	21X,5Y,1Z

7.4% 1. Is the subject matter of the unit too difficult for your students?

37.0% 2. Is the subject matter of the unit too elementary?

11.1% 3. Did you feel unnecessarily restricted by the directions in the Teacher's Guide?

11.8% 4. Would you change the order of the activities?

3.63* 5. How much did you like teaching the unit? (24 teachers)

A. Not at all. B. Little.
C. Generally. D. Very much.

3.38* 6. Compared to what takes place in your non-HSGP classes, how effective was this unit? (24 teachers)

A. Much less effective. B. Somewhat less effective.
C. Somewhat more effective D. Much more effective.

3.54* 7. Compared to other things students might learn from geography how worthwhile were the learnings of this unit? (24 teachers)

A. Not at all worthwhile. B. Generally not worthwhile.
C. Generally worthwhile. D. Very worthwhile.

*Refer to page 3 for explanation of how means are derived.

APPENDIX B
Teacher Activity Questionnaire Summary

	Cattle 1	Games 2	Sports 3	Islam 4	Canada 5	Cultural Change 6
Teacher enjoyment	3.66	3.51	3.54	3.46	3.26	3.71
Teacher view of effectiveness of non HSGP	3.21	3.19	3.36	3.18	3.07	3.61
Teacher view of worth of other geography	3.24	3.41	3.38	3.50	3.37	3.71
Teaching procedures clear?*	97%	96%	100%	89%	89%	100%
Objectives clear?*	97%	100%	100%	100%	89%	100%
More geographic background needed?*	28%	7%	15%	25%	30%	18%
Questions effective?*	90%	88%	92%	93%	78%	96%
Readings OK for average students?*	100%	100%	100%	96%	100%	96%
Readings OK for poor readers?*	78%	83%	96%	46%	75%	70%
More reading needed?	42%	40%	26%	33%	35%	13%
Less reading needed?	0%	0%	0%	21%	0%	8%
Visuals effective?	100%	96%	96%	93%	89%	96%
Placement of activity OK?	96%	96%	100%	100%	88%	100%
Guide too restrictive?	3%	12%	4%	4%	8%	4%
Time taken	130	149	139	199	132	104
Extra time needed	4	10	12	18	14	15
Teacher enjoyment last year	3.65	3.14	3.58	2.96**	3.11	3.85

* % affirmative
** European Expansion

APPENDIX C

1968 HSGP Activities Compared to 1967 norms

1. Teacher Enjoyment Index

1967 Activities Ranked		1968 Activities Ranked	
1. Game of Farming	4.00		
		Story of Portsville	3.97
2. Portsville	3.92	Game of Farming	3.92
3. Intro. to Japan	3.90		
4. Trend toward Uniformity Cities	3.85		
		Cities with Special Functions	3.83
		Hunger	3.79
5. Local Community Study	3.78		
Bigger Beef	3.78		
		Metfab	3.76
7. Hunger	3.73	Culture Change	3.71
1st Quartile			
		Geog. Patterns of Manuf.	3.69
		Interviews with Farmers	3.69
		New Orleans	3.69
8. Site Selections	3.67	Cattle	3.66
Case Studies Mitaka, Niike	3.67		
10. Cattle	3.65		
11. Life of a Japanese Family Man	3.60		
12. A Lesson from Sports	3.57		
		City Location & Growth	3.55
13. Interviews with Farmers	3.54	Sports	3.54
		Games	3.51
Median			

1967 Activities Ranked		1968 Activities Ranked	
		Importance of Manufacturing	3.50
14. Modernization and Pop. Growth-Japan	3.50	Islam	3.46
15. Time-Distance	3.44		
16. Hunger Revisited	3.33	Enough Food for the World	3.35
		Graphic Ex. of Ind.Loc	3.32
		Agricultural Realm	3.28
		Canada	3.26
		Shopping Trips & Trade Areas	3.23
17. Games Illustrating Spread of Ideas	3.22		
18. Canada	3.11	Models of City Form	3.11
19. Bruges	3.07		
		Time, Place & the Model	3.05
3rd Quartile			
20. A Few American Cities	3.04		
21. Agricultural Realm	3.00		
22. European Expansion	2.96		
23. Dist. of Econ. Act. in Japan	2.88		
24. Models of City Form	2.83		
		A model of Settlement Systems	2.74
25. Pop. in Pre Mod. Japan	2.70		
26. Red. of Pop. in Japan	2.67		

Appendix C

II. Index of Teacher Estimate of Effectiveness for 1968 Activities*

1.	Portsville	3.86
2.	Game of Farming	3.85
3.	Culture Change	3.61
4.	New Orleans	3.57
5.	Location of Metfab	3.55
	Hunger	3.55
7.	Geog. Patterns of Manuf.	3.39
8.	Interviews with Farmers	3.38
9.	City Location & Growth	3.36
10.	Sports	3.36
11.	Cities with Special Functions	3.30
12.	Cattle	3.21
13.	Games	3.19
14.	Islam	3.18
15.	Importance of Manufacturing	3.08
16.	Canada	3.07
17.	Graphic Ex. of Ind. Location	3.04
18.	Enough Food for the World	3.00
	Shopping Trips and Trade Areas	3.00
20.	Agricultural Realm	2.86
21.	Time, Place and the Model	2.85
22.	Models of City Form	2.67
23.	A Model of Settlement Systems	2.22

* There are no norms for 1967 on this index.

Appendix C

1968 Activities Compared to
1967 Norms

III. Student Estimate of Interest

1967 Activities Ranked		1968 Activities Ranked	
		Game of Farming	3.65
		Story of Portsville	3.[illegible]
1. Game of Farming	3.59		
2. Story of Portsville	3.34		
		Metfab	3.26
		Sports	3.16
		New Orleans	3.15
		Hunger	3.13
		City Location & Growth	3.1[illegible]
		Culture Change	3.02
		Cities with Special Functions	3.01
		Games	3.00
		Interviews with Farmers	3.00
3. Site Selection	2.98	Cattle	2.97
		Enough Food for the World	2.95
		Importance of Manufacturing	2.93
4. Cattle	2.85	Graphic Examples of Industrial Location	2.88
Interviews with Farmers	2.85		
Games Illustrating the Spread of Ideas	2.85		
		Canada	2.85
		Geographic Patterns of Manufacturing	2.84
7. A Lesson from Sports	2.81	Agricultural Realm	2.83

1st Quartile

	1967 Activites Ranked		1968 Activites Ranked	
8.	Hunger	2.79		
9.	Life of a Japanese Man	2.78		
			Models of City Form	2.75
			Shopping Trips and Trade Areas	2.75
10.	Agricultural Realm	2.73	Islam	2.69
11.	Models of City Growth	2.72		
12.	Bigger Beef	2.71		
13.	Trend Toward Uniformity in Cities	2.69		
Median				
14.	Hunger Revisited	2.68		
15.	A Few American Cities	2.66		
16.	Local Community Study	2.63		
			Time, Place and the Model	2.62
17.	Canada	2.51		
	Time Distance	2.51		
19.	European Expansion	2.48	A Model of Settlement Systems	2.48
3rd Quartile				
20.	Bruges	2.44		
21.	Introduction to Japan	2.43		
22.	Case Studies: Mitaka and Niike	2.41		
23.	Modernization and Population Growth	2.27		
24.	Redistribution of Population in Japan	2.05		
25.	Population in Pre-Modern Japan	2.04		
26.	Distribution of Economic Activities in Japan	2.00		

Appendix C

1968 Activities Compared to
1967 Norms

IV. Student Estimate of Worth Index

1967 Activities Ranked		1968 Activites Ranked	
1. Game of Farming	3.43		
2. Story of Portsville	3.40		
		Game of Farming	3.38
		Story of Portsville	3.27
		Hunger	3.22
		Metfab	3.17
		Sports	3.07
		City Loc. & Growth	3.06
		Enough Food for the World	3.05
3. Interviews with Farmers	3.04		
		New Orleans	3.00
		Cattle	2.99
		Culture Change	2.99
		Importance of Manufacturing	2.96
4. Cattle	2.93	Agricultural Realm	2.93
		Special Functions of Cities	2.92
		Graphic Ex. of Ind. Loc.	2.91
		Interview with Farmers	2.91
5. Games Illus. Spread Ideas	2.90		
6. Site Selection	2.89	Games	2.89
7. Hunger	2.88	Models of City Form	2.89

1st Quartile

	1967 Activities Ranked		1968 Activities Ranked	
			Geographic Patterns of Manuf.	2.87
8.	A Lesson from Sports	2.84		
			Canada	2.85
9.	Life of a Japanese Farm Man	2.80	Islam	2.82
	Agricultural Realm	2.80		
11.	Models of City Growth	2.79	Shopping Trips & Trade Areas	2.79
12.	Bigger Beef	2.73		
13.	Hunger revisited	2.71		
Median				
14.	Time Distance	2.71		
			Time, Place & the Model	2.70
15.	Trend Toward Unif. Cities	2.67		
16.	Canada	2.62		
			A Model of Settlement Systems	2.61
17.	Local Community Study	2.58		
18.	European Expansion	2.57		
19.	A Few American Cities	2.56		
3rd Quartile				
20.	Bruges	2.52		
	Case Studies Mitaka, Niike	2.52		
22.	Redist. of Pop. in Japan	2.42		
23.	Mod. & Pop. Growth Japan	2.40		
24.	Intro. to Japan	2.37		
25.	Pop. in Pre-Mod. Japan	2.28		
26.	Dist. of Econ. Activities	2.26		